USING STORY MAP STRATEGY IN HELPING LOW ACHIEVERS TO COMPREHEND THE SMALL 'I' (literature)

HERJIT KAUR



SCHOOL OF EDUCATION AND SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA SABAH 2008

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the material in this thesis is my own except quotations, excerpts, equations, summaries and references, which have been duly acknowledged.

9 May 2008

Herjit Kaur PT20068102



UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA SABAH

BORANG PENGESAHAN TESIS		
JUDUL :		
ШАZAH :		
SAYA :(HURUF BESAR)	SESI PENGAJIAN :	
	ana/Doktor Falsafah) ini disimpan di Perpustakaan Universiti Malaysia rti berikut:-	
	laysia Sabah. abah dibenarkan membuat salinan untuk tujuan pengajian sahaja. t salinan tesis ini sebagai bahan pertukaran antara institusi pengajian	
seperti yang TERHAD (Mengandu	ingi maklumat yang berdarjah keselamatan atau kepentingan Malaysia g termaktub di AKTA RAHSIA RASMI 1972) ingi maklumat TERHAD yang telah ditentukan oleh organisasi/badan di elidikan dijalankan)	
TIDAK TERHAD	Disahkan oleh:	
(TANDATANGAN PENULIS) Alamat Tetap:	(TANDATANGAN PUSTAKAWAN)	
TARIKH:	(NAMA PENYELIA) TARIKH:	
menyatakan sekali sebab dan tempoh te	npirkan surat daripada pihak berkuasa/organisasi berkenaan dengan esis ini perlu dikelaskan sebagai SULIT dan TERHAD. azah Doktor Falsafah dan Sarjana Secara Penyelidikan atau disertai	

bagi pengajian secara kerja kursus dan Laporan Projek Sarjana Muda (LPSM).

VERIFICATION

TITLE

: USING STORY MAP STRATEGY IN HELPING LOW ACHIEVERS TO

COMPREHEND THE SMALL 'L' (literature)

DEGREE

: MASTER IN TESL

VIVA DATE

: 11 JUNE 2008

DECLARED BY

1. SUPERVISOR DR. SUYANSAH SWANTO

Dr. Suyansah Swanto Deputy Dean (Student's Welfare) Centre for Postgraduate Studies Universiti Melaysia Sabah



..... to my beloved father and late mother.



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Sincere and heartfelt thanks to my supervisor, Dr. Suyansah Swanto for all the guidance and knowledge showered throughout the preparation of this dissertation.

I would like to thank all the students of SK Kepayan involved in this study and colleagues who have indirectly contributed towards the completion of this research.

I would also like to thank my family members, my brother, sisters and sister-in-law for their help and support. My special appreciation to my loving husband and my second sister for their constant help and support, and for being there for me throughout the period of this programme.



ABSTRAK

Kajian ini tertumpu kepada satu strategi pengajaran dan pembelajaran yang dinamakan 'Story Map Strategy' (SMS). Ia bertujuan untuk menilai keberkesanan kaedah ini dalam meningkatkan kemahiran membaca dan pemahaman bahasa Inggeris sebagai bahasa kedua dalam kalangan pelajar yang lemah. Satu kumpulan rawatan pelajar Tahun 5 yang lemah diajar cerita pendek di mana terdapat komponen-komponen seperti watak, masa, tempat, masalah, tujuan, jalan cerita dan penutup, kesusasteraan Bahasa Inggeris yang mana menggunakan SMS, manakala satu kumpulan kawalan didedahkan dengan kaedah pembelajaran tradisional bagi jangkamasa enam minggu. Kajian ini melibatkan 60 pelajar lemah dalam Tahun 5 dalam sebuah sekolah bandar. Pelajar di bahagikan kepada dua kumpulan, rawatan (N=30) dan kawalan (N=30). Kajian ini berbentuk 'mixed methods' dimana keduadua data kualitatif dan kuantitatif dikumpul. Data yang dikumpul lebih kepada alatalat kuantitatif iaitu, pra-ujian, post-ujian, portfolio dan menceriakan semula. 'Paired samples T-test" digunakan untuk menganalisa keputusan ujian alat-alat quantitative Disamping itu, data kualitatif yang mana melibatkan wawancara yang berstruktur memberi data tambahan untuk menyokong dan meneguhkan dapatan kajian ini. Kajian ini juga mendedahkan subjek yang telah didedahkan kepada SMS menunjukkan penambahbaikan yang nyata dalam keupayaan mereka untuk memahami cerita pendek, Keputusan kajian menunjukkan penambahbaikan yang signifikasi dikalangan murid yang berpercapaian rendah selepas didedahkan kepada SMS berbanding mereka yang didedahkan dengan kaedah tradisional. Kajian ini juga mendapati bahawa pelajar dalam kumpulan rawatan menyuarakan keseronokan mereka dalam pembelajaran menggunakan SMS kerana kaedah ini mudah dan ianya meringkaskan cerita dalam ayat yang pendek dan mudah. Kajian ini juga memberi pengetahuani kepada guru dalam kaedah dan aktiviti-aktiviti yand selaras dengan SMS.

ABSTRACT

This study focuses on the teaching and learning of a strategy called Story Map Strategy (SMS). The aim of the study was to evaluate the effectiveness of using SMS in improving the reading and comprehension skills of low achievers (LA) of English as Second Language (ESL). One group of fifth grade LA-ESL students was taught using story map with grammar components eg. the character, time, place, problem, goal, events and ending, while the control group was taught using conventional literature based method for a duration of six weeks. The samples for this study were 60 fifth grade LA-ESL students who were low achievers studying in an urban school. The samples were divided into two groups, treatment (N=30) and control group (N=30). A mixed methods research approach was applied where both qualitative and quantitative data were collected. The major data collected were on the quantitative instruments namely the pre-test, post-test, portfolio and retelling which were essential to determine the effectiveness of story map strategy. A paired samples Ttest was employed to analyse the quantitative test scores. On the other hand, the qualitative study which involved a structured interview of the subjects provided additional data to support and reinforce the findings of this research. The study revealed that the subjects who were exposed to SMS showed visible improvement in their ability to comprehend the short stories. The results showed a significant improvement among the low achievers in their reading and comprehension skills after they were exposed to SMS compared to those exposed to conventional method of instruction. Most importantly, the subjects in the treatment group expressed preference to story map strategy as it was easy and it helped them to simplify the story in short and simple sentences. This study also provided some insight for teachers on the process and activities needed when story map strategy is carried out in the literature classroom.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		PAGE
DECLARATION		ii
VERIFICATION		iii
ACKNOWLEDG		iv
ABSTRAK		v
ABSTRACT		vi
TABLE OF COM	NTENT	vii
LIST OF FIGUR		×
LIST OF TABLE	ES	xi
LIST OF ABBR	EVIATIONS	xii
CHAPTER 1:	INTRODUCTION	
1.	Introduction	1
1.2	Background of the study	2
1.3	Statement of the Problem	4
1.4	Research Questions UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA SABAH	5
1.5	Aims	5
1.6	Objective of the Study	6
1.7	Research Hypotheses	6
1.8	Operational Definition	7
1.9	Significance of the Study	9
1.10	Conclusions	9
CHAPTER 2:	LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1	Introduction	10
2.2	Schema Theory	10
2.3	Previous Research	11
	2.3.1 Historical perspectives	11

	2.3.2 Literature-based reading instruction	13
	2.3.3 Summary of research using story map	
	as instructional content	14
2.4	Story Map Model	16
2.5	Conclusions	19
CHAPTER 3:	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	
3.1	Introduction	20
3.2	Research Design	20
3.3	Research Procedure	22
3.4	Weekly Research Schedule	24
3.5	Population and Sampling	26
3.6	Research Materials	27
3.7	Research Instruments	27
	3.7.1 Pretest & Posttest	28
	3.7.2 Portfolio	30
	3.6.3 Retelling	32
	3.6.4 Interview	33
3.8	Data Collection and Analysis	34
3.9	Pilot Study UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA SABAH	35
3.10	Conclusions	35
CHAPTER 4:	FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS	
4.1	Introduction	37
4.2	Data Analysis	38
	4.2.1 Research Question 1	38
	4.2.2 Research Question 2	41
	4.2.3 Research Question 3	49
4.3	Conclusions	53

CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

5.1	Introduction	54
5.2	2 Summary of The Results	55
5.3	Implications of This Study	56
5.4	Limitation of The Study	57
5.5	Recommendations For Future Research	58
5.6	5 Conclusions	59
BIBLIOGRAPI	НҮ	61
APPENDICES		67



	LIST OF FIGURES	PAGE
Figure 2.1	Early story map form	18
Figure 2.2	Story map game board Ira Sleep Over	19
Figure 3.1	Conceptual Framework	21
Figure 3.2	Research Procedure	22
Figure 3.3	Evaluation of Student's Retelling	33



LIST OF TABLES

		PAGE
Table 3.1	Weekly activities during the duration of the study	25
Table 4.1	Pre -Test and Post-Test Score for the Treatment Group	39
Table 4.2	Paired Samples Statistics for the Post-test and Pre-test of the Treatment Group	40
Table 4.3	Paired Sample Test for the Post-test and Pre-test of the Treatment Group	40
Table 4.4	Post-test Scores for the Control and Treatment Groups	42
Table 4.5	Paired Samples Statistics of Post-test the Treatment and Control Groups	43
Table 4.6	Paired Sample Test of Post-test for the Treatment and Control Groups	43
Table 4.7	Portfolio Scores for the Treatment and Control Groups	44
Table 4.8	Paired Samples Statistics of Portfolio for the Treatment and Control Groups	45
Table 4.9	Paired Sample Test for Portfolio of the Treatment and Control Groups	46
Table 4.10	Retelling Scores for the Control and Treatment Groups	47
Table 4.11	Paired Samples Statistics of Retelling for the Treatment and Control Groups	48
Table 4.12	Paired Sample Test of Retelling for the Treatment and Control Groups	48

LIST OF ABBREVATIONS

ESL English as Second Language

'l' Literature

LA Low Achiever

SMS Story Map Strategy

LA-ESL Low Achiever – English as a Second Language

HA-ESL High Achiever – English as a Second Language



CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

"A good narrative – a story – has all the elements that make the learning experience interesting, memorable and rewarding ".

(Vacca & Vacca 1996, p.74)

1.1 INTRODUCTION

English language being the 'second' language in Malaysian schools from primary to secondary level, has continually attracted the attention of the Education Ministry to upgrade the 'language skills' among students. To upgrade these skills, the Ministry in 2004 introduced literature (small 'l') in the English subject in Malaysian schools. The small 'l' is referred to as primary school literature. The aims are to help and encourage pupils improve their English language through reading simple text and related materials. Some of the objectives of introducing small 'l' include: to instill reading habit, to enrich vocabulary, to enhance thinking skills, to promote cultural understanding in the Malaysian context, to provide lively enjoyable and high-interest readings and above all to improve English language proficiency of pupils in Malaysian schools (Pusat Perkembangan Kurikulum handout, 2004).

UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA SABAH

The purpose of the current research is to investigate the effectiveness of using story mapping in helping low achievers in English as Second language (LA-ESL) to comprehend the small 'l' (literature). Rosenblatt (1991: 444) defines literature as an aesthetic experience, which involves "reading with attention, of course, to what the words refer to, but mainly to what we are experiencing, thinking and feeling during the reading". "Literature is for anyone who delights in a story and searches for meaning in the human condition. In school the literature belongs to all teachers who embrace the common-ground belief that imaginative texts have the potential to capture student's interest and extend their knowledge of people, places, processes, events and ideas" (Vacca & Vacca, 1996: 72).

1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

According to 'Pusat Perkembangan Kurikulum Kementerian Pelajaran Malaysia' (2004: 4) children's literature can be defined as "the material created for and widely read, viewed and heard by children that has an imaginative element". In 2004 the Education Ministry decided that Children's Contemporary Literature should be taught in Year 4, 5 and 6. The rationale for this is to provide an early beginning and a foundation in literature. Pupils will develop an understanding of other societies, cultures, values and traditions that help them in their emotional and spiritual growths. Finally it also serves as a follow-up to the structured reading programme for secondary school students.

The Ministry of Education has prepared modules for the teachers for teaching literature. These modules provide teachers with specific aims and objectives of teaching literature and also specify guidelines, exercises and activities for student to perform. However, these modules are not sufficient especially for teachers who have never been exposed to teaching small 'l'.

Strategies such as Story Map Strategy (SMS) may have additional benefits in teaching literature. As teachers depend totally on modules recommended by the Ministry of Education, which is their main source to teaching literature, it can be observed that teachers do not use story map strategies while teaching literature in their schools and it is not a skill that is currently taught in schools.

It is to be emphasized that in teaching contemporary children literature, only short story texts are used and pupils are instructed to read the whole text. Contemporary literature—based reading instruction that is supported by a wide variety of materials include children's literature (eg. picture books and trade books), "pop" literature (eg. lyrics, comics, and joke books), newspaper, magazines, and student written publications. The major area of instructional research with slow learners and low achievers (LA) has focused on problems on reading (Johnson and Morasky, 1980). Low achievers generally experience difficulties with varieties of reading skills, particularly reading comprehension (Klauger and Kolson, 1978).

Reading problems often become one of the main causes of failures in schools. Even strong third-grade readers are not guaranteed future success; they are at risk for later academic problems if reading instruction is neglected in the middle and upper grades (Biancarosa & Snow, 2004). Reading problems cannot be expected to vanish without targeted intervention, and over time the negative impact of reading difficulties intensifies, affecting students in a variety of ways. Although reading deficiencies may appear to be specific and narrow in the primary grades, they tend to become generalized over time, affecting cognitive development and overall performance in school (Stanovich, 1986). Poor comprehension ability may be related to a lack of comprehension strategies, vocabulary, or background knowledge. As students progress through school, they must rely more and more on their ability to read increasingly varied and complicated content to acquire knowledge (Roe, Stoodt, & Burns, 2001; Wilson, 1999). Secondly, by middle school, many students, not just struggling readers, begin to read less outside of school and become more likely to develop negative attitudes about reading. These tendencies are most prevalent in struggling readers (Ivey & Broaddus, 2000; Guthrie & Wigfield, 2000). As an English teacher teaching literature, I have decided to address this problem by applying Story Map Strategy (SMS) in helping LA-ESL students to acquire better reading skills. As such this study is carried out with the intention to broaden mine and other teacher's knowledge on the effectiveness of using SMS in helping LA-ESL students to comprehend the small \\'.\'.\'.\'SIA SABAH

The effectiveness of SMS in improving comprehension has been demonstrated with Low Achievers and High Achievers in English as second language (LA-ESL and HA-ESL) (Idol, 1987) and this technique uses story grammar components to promote comprehension of narrative texts. Story maps have been used as pre-reading (Davis, 1994) and post-reading (Reutzel, 1984) procedures. Furthermore, variations of a simple story map can be used to promote inferential thinking, a higher-level cognitive skill that is necessary for comprehension (Davis & McPherson, 1989).

Story maps provide a practical means for helping children organize story content into coherent wholes. These story maps are derived from the integration of literal and implicit information about the main characters, events, and ideas presented in a story.

(Beck & McKeown, 1981) I concur with these authors that story maps will be a better alternative for the students to remember the sequential of the plot in a story. Therefore my definition of story map is that it is a graphic representation of the elements including setting, problem, goal, events and resolution. Students will be able to remember the events in a plot using story map.

Story map strategy can provide the basis for assessment strategies that inform teachers about both the students' comprehension of a particular text and their literacy knowledge. The map should reveal the central ideas and should also capture the underlying relationships among events.

Reading, however, does not occur unless an individual comprehends. Comprehension is the process whereby the reader constructs meaning by interacting with the text (Anderson & Pearson, 1984; Cooper, 1886), and can be studied from different perspectives and approaches. Comprehension has been investigated in terms of reader's cognitive structures or schema. Comprehension has also been investigated for different types of text variables and types, including narrative and expository texts (McGee, 1982). One such area of research has focused on the reader's schemata for stories and the structure of stories to be comprehended, and is termed as story grammar and/or story map.

1.3 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

After 4 years of teaching literature in ESL classroom at the school being study, more often than not, the literature components are seen as reading comprehension lessons. The teachings are mostly based on the dull talk and chalk methods, one-way teacher centered and mechanistic. Teachers need to apply methodologies which indirectly focus on individual task among students. Students are usually expected to listen and comprehend what is being taught, where literary items or texts are taught repeatedly, one after the other. There is hardly any active involvement, voicing of opinions or space for creative learning of the literary text.

At the onset of this investigation, some problems were encountered with the students. Students in this school had only limited instructions in English language, three hours per week using a direct instruction technique. Secondly, English being the second language and third language for some students, posed problems in comprehending the story structure.

Student's writing and reading instruction in previous years have been limited to very basic contents in literature. More often they tend to structure words and sentences from the Malay language, thus deviating from authentic sentence structures. Also, they are always least motivated to read and write in English over their own language. They often think in Malay while constructing English sentences, thus distorting the meaning.

1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

This study addresses the following research questions concerning the relationship between Story Map Strategy and student's performance in comprehending the literature and improving their reading skills:

- 1. What impact SMS technique has on fifth grade students performance in comprehending the small 'l' before and after intervention?
- 2. Would the fifth grade students show a better understanding of the small 'l' after intervention compared to those who received conventional reading instructions?
- 3. What are the student's perceptions toward introducing this technique and learning of literature through SMS?

1.5 AIMS

The aim of this study is to evaluate the effectiveness of literature based reading instruction that incorporates the story mapping strategy. More specifically, this study will examine the impact of this instructional strategy on the reading/comprehension skills of

fifth grade LA-ESL students. It is also to demonstrate whether it is viable to introduce story map strategy in the teaching of literature.

1.6 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

Story map is an excellent way to help students to see cause and effect, recall story events in sequential order, and understand story structure, thus improving their comprehension skills and understand literature better. The current investigation intends to meet the following objectives:

- 1. To investigate the effects of story map strategy on the reading and comprehension skills of fifth grader low achievers.
- 2. To examine whether the students find this strategy helpful in enhancing their reading/comprehension skills.
- 3. To demonstrate the viability of introducing this strategy as a routine class-based instructional technique.

1.7 RESEARCH HYPOTHESES

The hypothesis for this research is whether incorporating story map in teaching of literature in the classroom will enable students to comprehend/understand the text (literature) better. Like research questions, hypotheses narrow the purpose statement in mixed method research, but advance a prediction about what the researcher expects to find. Based upon previous research findings, elaborated in Chapter 2 it is predicted that SMS will have a positive outcome on the subjects (LA-ESL) targeted for this research.

Null Hypotheses, the most traditional form of writing a hypothesis predicts that among a population there is no relationship between independent and dependent variables. In contrast, if a research predicts a relationship of difference among the variables from past research or explanations, alternative hypotheses may best be hypothesized to predict the direction of change or a relationship among the variables

under investigation (Creswell, 2004: 131-132). Based upon the first and second research questions of this study, it is hypothesized:

- Ha 1 There is a significant difference in the understanding of the small 'I' by the fifth grade students before and after being instructed through story map strategy.
- Ha 2 There is a significant difference in the post-test score of the treatment and control groups.
- Ha 3 There is a significant difference in the portfolio score of the treatment and control groups.
- Ha 4 There is a significant difference in the retelling score of the treatment and control groups.

The third research question is measured using interview as it involves a qualitative approach to data collection.

1.8 OPERATIONAL DEFINITIONS

Two basic aspects will be explored in this study: First, an identification of targeted population of 'low achievers' in English as the second language; secondly, the fluency in reading by improving comprehension through an instructional strategy of story grammar/story mapping. In the following section, some of the key terms frequently used in this study are described and defined.

Low Achievers and High Achievers in English as Second Language, (LA-ESL) and (HA-ESL): In this study, the subjects were taken from a group of students with LA-ESL and HA-ESL. Low achiever students were those whose academic performance did not match the evaluated cognitive skills in English as the Second Language. In addition, these students were reading at levels lower than those evaluated as HA-ESL.

Reading Comprehension: In this study, the successful reading comprehension of a story was measured by a story re-telling, where the students reviewed the story by telling the instructor (teacher), what happened?

Story Grammar: When considering narrative texts, the structural aspect is called story grammar. This is the predictable structure of many stories. The story grammar component include: the character, time, place, problem, goal, events, ending and feelings (Mandler & Johnson, 1977; Stein & Tabasso, 1982; Thorndyke, 1977).

Story Map: Story mapping is a strategy that uses a story map to introduce the basic structure and essential elements of a story. A story map is a graphic display of the structure of a story and its parts. In this study, the story map was intended to show to the LA-ESL students; what a story typically consisted of and how it was organized (Beck & McKoewn, 1981).

Story Map Questions: Story map questions are cues that are used together with a story map. The cues can be provided in both written and oral form. These are simple questions intended to remind students of the basic elements of a story, such as character, setting, events, goal and outcome, and also the possible ideas associated with these elements. The questions can be used to guide students in developing their stories (Martha A. Keeler, 1993).

Instructional Strategy: This term referred to a specific method of instruction specifically designed for improving students' performance in a particular academic area or in the learning of a particular skill. In this study, the instructional strategy used story mapping and story map questions. The intended academic areas for improvement were student's reading fluency and comprehension (De La Paz, S.,1997).

Literature-Based Reading Instruction: Consisted of a short story from children's literature unfamiliar to the readers and used in the instructional strategy intervention process, involving story map and questionnaires (De La Paz, S., 1997). In

this the literature-based reading instruction refers to the prescribed short stories for the fifth graders.

1.9 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

Learning to read and write in English as a Second Language can be a difficult and frustrating experience or a natural challenge, depending on the instructional approach.

This study will attempt to answer key questions regarding instruction strategies for slow learners and low achievers in the subject of English as the Second Language (LA-ESL). As reading is a critical skill for achieving excellence in academic pursuits, success in development of reading competence of children is therefore a vital process.

This research and development on SMS would provide an alternative approach to help students who are weak in comprehending literature. Besides, it will also contribute towards the expansion of knowledge and research in this area. If there is a positive relationship and a significant difference between story map strategy and students' comprehension of literature, then teaching story map strategy would be an ideal skill to be introduced in the classroom.

1.10 CONCLUSION

Development of the ability to read fluently and comprehend literature is very important for slow learners and low achievers in English as the Second Language. Effective strategies are the keys to enable low achievers to become good readers with a well developed comprehension. Story mapping based instructional strategies may hold promise for many students who are slow learners and low achievers in English as the Second Language.

CHAPTER 2

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

"Literature includes any kind of information of imaginative text whose content illuminates the readers' experience. For young adults and children alike, literature serves a dual purpose: to educate and to entertain."

(Vacca & Vacca, 1996: 75)

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter examines studies that were carried out by other researchers related to story map strategy. The discussion in this chapter will centre around the key factors involving story grammar and story mapping and how this particular strategy can assist LA-ESL students in comprehending the small 'I'.

2.2 SCHEMA THEORY

In order for effective comprehension to be achieved, the reader should understand and analyze the story grammar as well as the other story components. Readers use their schema, a construct used in theories of perception, memory and learning, to comprehend any text (Schirmer, 2000). Textual schema refers to readers' mental organization of how a typical text is structured. The reader's cognitive representation of narrative text is known as 'story schema' which is a type of textual schema. Story schema provides reader's with an expectation of the form of a typical story. Skilled readers use their schema to make sense of the story by noticing the important or relevant aspects of the story, paying attention to how the story parts fit together and recall the story (Kameenui & Simmons, 1990; Schirmer, 2000). In addition to its importance for comprehension, internalization of a story grammar is also related to writing development (Schirmer, 2000). Piaget uses the concept of schema in his theory of cognitive development. In this theory, schemas refer to the basic structure through which an individual's knowledge is mentally represented. Piaget's schemas are somewhat abstract and can be roughly defined as a mental unit that represents a class of similar actions or thoughts. Schema theory focuses on reader variables, or the schema that readers develop during comprehension (Ormrod, 1995). In essence,